

9

CONFIGURING CRITIQUE (OR ‘THE ART OF NOT BEING GOVERNED QUITE SO MUCH’)

Jane Rendell

Prologue

In 2013, I wrote an essay on the practice of artist/architect Apolonija Šušteršič where I examined her work in relation to seven problematics—critical, spatial, pedagogical, functional, relational, performative, and transitional—as sites for debating and enacting artistic alternatives to neoliberalism. If, I asked, the term ‘liberal arts’ refers to the seven subjects of the medieval university curriculum, which include the Classical *Trivium* of grammar, rhetoric, and logic, and the Renaissance *Quadrivium* of mathematics, geometry, music, and astronomy, what kind of arts education do we need for the neoliberal times in which we live?¹

I reconfigured those seven problematics into a lecture that questioned the governance structures of the contemporary university, as an entity undergoing neoliberal marketization. The talk was delivered under Chatham House rules,² at the University of South Australia (Adelaide), in November 2013, in response to an invitation to give a keynote address at the conference ‘*Critique*’. I have since altered the transcript of that spoken text into a ‘site-writing’³ for this publication in order to provide a more public mode of telling. This site-writing concerns events that have taken place since 2013 when I first questioned University College of London’s (UCL’s) decision to accept US\$10 million of funding from the mining corporation BHP Billiton to create an International Energy Policy Institute in Adelaide, and the Institute for Sustainable Resources in London at the Bartlett Faculty of the Built Environment, of which I was then Vice Dean of Research.⁴ The partnership was initially set up in a time of enforced austerity economics in the public sector and higher education in the United Kingdom, taking place after the bank bailout and the introduction of £9,000-per-year fees for undergraduate students.

As it is based on a text derived from a speech, this essay is a form of rhetoric, which has been described as “the art of addressing pressing public concerns by employing deliberate persuasive strategies before a public audience at a specific occasion in order to transform some aspect of a problematic situation by encouraging new forms of thought and action.”⁵ In making a judgment about a ‘good’ and how one should pursue it, rhetoric involves using a number of tools: reason (*logos*), credibility (*ethos*), emotion (*pathos*), and style (*lexis*).⁶

The style or *lexis* of this particular rhetoric is close to what Donna Haraway and Rosi Braidotti might call a “feminist figuration.”⁷ Configured in seven parts, it is told through multiple registers or voices. The first voice, Pathos or Waking Up (**set in bold**), takes an emotional

tone; here I convey worries about the work involved in my institutional role at UCL, which woke me before dawn over a seven-month period from January to July 2013. This is followed by a second voice, Logos or Configuring Critique (set in plain text), which sets out a more reasoned mode of argument where I speak of ideas taken from my own intellectual writing set in relation to concepts generated by others concerning critique and what it can do. A third aspect of rhetoric is its ethos or appeal to credibility. So, for the third voice, Ethos or Strong and Consistent Narratives, I have chosen to present two narratives of credibility concerning BHP Billiton's actions. This includes data (*set in bold italics*)⁸ gathered by RepRisk, a company who

In the landscape of available ESG information . . . takes a unique approach to assessing risk . . . capturing and analyzing data from media, stakeholders, and other public sources *external* to the company. This insight helps balance and substantiate the information provided by the company itself, and helps assess whether a company's intention—policies, processes, and commitments—translates into practice.⁹

These are followed by texts drawn directly from the BHP Billiton's website (*set in italics*), which convey the values of the corporation itself. These words may include those devised by Blue Rubicon, an award-winning communications consultancy, who in 2013 listed BHP Billiton as one of their clients, and who specialize in the creation what they call "strong and consistent narrative[s]":

We build powerful and compelling stories to shape positive sentiment and protect reputation in difficult times. By testing narratives rigorously, we de-risk communication, helping major corporations, ambitious smaller organizations and brands, to develop messages which cut-through to quickly connect with their audiences.¹⁰

I

Waking Up: January 2013

The fear that woke my stomach, reaches my head. I am wide-awake in a still-dark bedroom with the realization that when morning comes I will have to explain the implications of the research I have been conducting for UCL's risk register. As Vice Dean of Research,¹¹ I have been tasked to 'own' the risk of research expansion, and the aspect of risk I have focused on is UCL's academic independence and integrity, and the wider reputation of UCL as a global leader in research. I am going to suggest that one of the risks associated with research expansion comes from accepting financial gifts from corporations, particularly where there might be disparities between the practices of those corporations and UCL's own principles and procedures.

I am focusing in particular on UCL's decision to accept funding from the charitable arm of BHP Billiton—one of the world's largest mining corporations—in June 2011 to set up an Institute of Sustainable Resources (ISR) at UCL and position this inside the Bartlett in September 2012.¹² If we follow the Brundtland Report of 1987, which states that sustainable development must be "development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs,"¹³ then the mining of fossil fuels is unsustainable on two counts: first, fossil fuels are a finite resource, and second, as published climate science evidences, the limit of the ecosystem to absorb CO₂ has already been dangerously

surpassed. I will argue that UCL is taking a risk with its reputation for independent research into sustainability, allowing BHP Billiton to buy legitimacy for the continued mining of fossil fuels and to potentially influence not only policy on sustainability, but also the definition of this contested term.

I have judged the risk of potential damage to reputation to be significant enough to warrant purchasing a copy of a report by RepRisk on BHP Billiton.¹⁴

The RepRisk Index (RRI) is a quantitative risk measure that captures criticism and quantifies a company's or project's exposure to controversial environmental, social and governance issues. It does not measure a company's or project's overall reputation, but rather is an indicator of a company's or projects reputational risk.¹⁵

I will argue that the issues raised in the RepRisk report concerning BHP Billiton's activities appear to conflict with key UCL principles and procedures, as expressed in four documents:

- 1 *UCL's Research Strategy* is described as "Delivering a Culture of Wisdom":

UCL will seize the opportunity—and fulfil its obligation—to marshal the breadth of its expert perspectives, in order to address issues in their full complexity and contribute to the resolution of the world's major problems. This will be achieved not just through the generation of knowledge, but also through the delivery of a culture of wisdom, that is an environment committed to the judicious application of knowledge for the good of humanity.¹⁶

If we follow the definition of sustainability from the Brundtland Report 1987, and agree that the burning of fossil fuels "compromis[es] the ability of future generations to meet their own needs," then accepting funds generated from the profits of extracting fossil fuels to be burnt, cannot, in my view, be said to be consistent with "the judicious application of knowledge for the good of humanity."¹⁷

- 2 The introduction to *UCL's Environmental Strategy* states that:

The world is facing many environmental challenges including climate change, resource depletion, biodiversity loss and water shortages . . . These challenges must be addressed in the context of economic development, social change, and social justice, and UCL as a world-class, inter-disciplinary university has an important role to play: by addressing the environmental impact of its activities and operations; by providing ethical leadership through its decisions and actions.¹⁸

Accepting funding from a company whose core business causes catastrophic damage to the environment and contributes to social injustice goes directly against UCL's *Environmental Strategy* and stated aim of "address[ing] the environmental impact of its activities" and is not, in my view, an example of ethical leadership.¹⁹

- 3 *UCL's Research Ethics Framework* sets out ethical guidelines for research, overseen by the Research Governance Committee, and at 1.1 of the Introduction states:

UCL is committed to maintaining the integrity and probity of academic research and therefore regards it as fundamental that research should be conducted according to ethical guidelines defined by the wider research community. UCL interprets ethical issues broadly and considers that they include, *inter alia*: relevant codes of practice; the involvement of human participants, tissue, or data in research; the use of animals in research; research that may result in damage to the environment; the use of sensitive economic, social or personal data; and the acquisition, storage, and disposal of historical artefacts.²⁰

Accepting funding from fossil fuel companies provides cultural legitimacy to a set of activities that cause evidenced damage to the environment. So, although the research funded by this money may be conducted following relevant ethical codes of practice, the funding framework in which the research operates runs counter, in my view, to UCL's ethical guidelines.²¹

- 4 UCL's *Guidelines for the Acceptance of Gifts and Donations* has as its first principle the question of whether the "potential gift fit[s] with UCL's strategic mission?" and specifically asks:

Is there any reason to suspect that the proposed gift may be made from a source that arises in whole or in part from an illegal activity, or, more generally, from activities that may have . . . [v]iolated international conventions that bear on human rights?²²

It is clear from evidence gathered by independent sources, for example RepRisk, that the activities of fossil fuel companies, including BHP Billiton, and their subsidiaries, have been linked to serious human rights abuses:

a 2013 report by the Colombian Comptroller's Office . . . established a correlation between extractive industries and an increase in community leader and union-related killings, forced displacement, breach of indigenous peoples' rights to prior consultation, and repression of trade union activities. In particular, the Cerrejon Coal Mine, owned by BHP Billiton, Anglo American, and Glencore Xstrata, has been linked to serious human rights abuses. In September 2014, concerns were raised about plans to use the Colombian Mobile Anti-Disturbance Squadron to forcibly relocate 64 Wayuu families from the area around the mine, amid fears that it could result in the extinction of the indigenous community. In addition, the mine has been accused of emitting 82 million tonnes of carbon dioxide into the atmosphere every year, polluting local rivers, and using vast amounts of water. NGOs are urging HSBC, Lloyds Bank, BlackRock Advisors, and other investors to divest from the project.²³

Critique and criticism

The verb 'to criticise,' which describes the activity of a critic, is associated with the term 'critique' as well as the practice of criticism. While some have located critique as a social form (or subset) of criticism, I would rather take the line of thinking adopted by David Cunningham,

who notes that in Immanuel Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason* (1781) "critique comes to denote a specific reflection on the essential *conditions* and *limits* of possible knowledge."²⁴ While Cunningham goes on to state that critique only becomes self-reflective in G.W.F. Hegel's reworking of Kant, Peg Rawes has argued that it is in Kant's *Critique of Judgement* (1790) that critique becomes embodied.²⁵ Taken together these two viewpoints allow a concept of critique to emerge—self-reflective and embodied—that comes close to practice.

Report raises concerns about global warming from operations of Anglo American, BP, Rosneft, and others

22.01.2013 greenpeace.org

The report "Point of No Return," published by Greenpeace with research from the environmental consultancy Ecofys, has expressed serious concerns about a boost in mining, oil, and gas extraction by major multinational companies, including Adaro Energy, BHP Billiton, Gazprom, Peabody Energy, Vale, and others. The report claims that the projected activities of these companies could lead to a 20 per cent increase in CO2 levels as well as an increase of 5 to 6 degrees in global temperature by 2020. The report also argues that the environmental impacts of such changes could lead to impacts on food supplies and a series of social upheavals. Areas of particular concern include coal mining northwestern USA, Indonesia, China, and Australia's Gunnedah, Surat, and Galilee basins; tar sand exploration and oil pipelines by Enbridge and others in Canada; Arctic drilling by Gazprom and others in Russia; and deep-sea drilling off the Brazilian coast by Petrobras, BP, Shell, Total, and Statoil.²⁶

Our position on climate change

We accept the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change's (IPCC) assessment of climate change science, which has found that warming of the climate is unequivocal, the human influence is clear and physical impacts are unavoidable.

We believe the world must pursue the twin objectives of limiting climate change to the lower end of the IPCC emission scenarios in line with current international agreements, while providing access to reliable and affordable energy to support economic development and improved living standards. We do not prioritize one of these objectives over the other—both are essential to sustainable development.

Under all current plausible scenarios, fossil fuels will continue to be a significant part of the energy mix for decades. Therefore, an acceleration of effort to drive energy efficiency, develop and deploy low-emissions technology and adapt to the impacts of climate change is needed. We believe there should be a price on carbon, implemented in a way that addresses competitiveness concerns and achieves lowest cost emissions reductions.²⁷

II

Waking Up: February 2013

Since government funding to cover teaching costs has been all but removed in the United Kingdom, increasing efforts are being made to attract a new income stream—corporate sponsorship. But with so much talk of business links and enterprise, there has been very little institutional acknowledgement of the shifts in culture occurring in universities as a result of the reduction of state funding and the introduction of loans for UK students at undergraduate level. Yet I am reminded that UCL is not a public university, but a chartered corporation.²⁸ But if not public, UCL is still proud of its radical tradition, the fact that unlike Oxford and Cambridge, it was not founded as a religious entity, and that it was the first British university to accept women students on the same basis as men and award degrees to women. In

fact, quite recently, being ‘radical’ has become key to our brand: a briefing from the communications team invites us to speak in a radical and open voice.

Critical spatial practice

In *Art and Architecture: A Place Between* I coined the term “critical spatial practice” to define modes of self-reflective artistic and architectural practice that seek to question the social conditions of the sites into which they intervene.²⁹ Through the process of writing the book I came to understand that my own position between art, architecture, and theory was constantly changing and influenced the interpretative accounts I was able to offer. I concluded *Art and Architecture* by arguing that the writing of criticism is itself a form of situated practice, one that is critical and spatial.³⁰

Newmont Mining, Chinalco and others face resistance from local communities in Peru

06.02.2013 Financial Times

The Government of Peru’s apparent effort to welcome copper producing companies such as Xstrata, BHP Billiton, Candente Copper, and Chinalco has generated negative response from indigenous communities and caused more than 200 concession related conflicts in Peru. Riots in Cajamarca relating to Newmont Mining’s Minas Conga project have raised concerns amongst the National Mining Society and human rights activists, who reported as many as 16 dispute related deaths since September 2011. Water use and water supply damage concerns have been a major cause for resistance. Southern Copper’s Tia Maria Mine was blocked in 2011 due to agriculture and water depletion and soil contamination. Chinalco is also facing resistance from residents near the Toromocho Cooper Mine who are requesting USD 300 million in compensations for relocation and the destruction of their village.³¹

Approval for Antamina Expansion

05 January 2010, 11:00 AM

BHP Billiton today announced it has approved its share of the capital expenditure required to expand mining and processing capacity at the Antamina copper and zinc mine in northern Peru.

Antamina is a joint venture between BHP Billiton (33.75%), Xstrata (33.75%), Teck Resources (22.5%), and Mitsubishi Corporation (10%). All four partners have approved their respective shares of the project’s US\$1,288 million capital budget (BHP Billiton share US\$434.7 million).

The expansion project will increase the site’s ore processing capacity by 38% to 130,000 tonnes per day. Higher mineral ore reserves previously reported in combination with the expanded processing capacity will result in a mine life extension of 6 years from 2023 until 2029. First production from the expansion is anticipated in late 2011.³²

III

Waking Up: March 2013

Before dawn, almost every night now, I am jolted awake, surprised and disorientated for a second or two, then I remember, and the panic rears up through me. Will fighting this battle—pitting myself against my institution—loose me my job? Has UCL done its homework, and even if it has, will the right governance structures and due diligence procedures really be able to protect the independence of academic research? UCL has argued that one of the reasons for engaging with businesses is in order to change them. But I still cannot grasp how on the one hand when the funding is at arm’s length the giver of the gift—or in this case charitable donation—*should*

not influence the research funded by the gift or benefit from the research that is conducted, but that, on the other, the receiver of the gift should influence the activities of the giver.

Relational critique

If criticism can be defined by the purpose of providing a commentary on a cultural work, then criticism always has an ‘other’ in mind. The central task of criticism might then be considered as: how does one relate to an ‘other’? Grounded in the object relations theory of D.W. Winnicott, for psychoanalyst Jessica Benjamin the central task of psychoanalysis is the “double task of recognition: how analyst and patient make known their own subjectivity and recognize the other’s.”³³

Winnicott’s idea of the transitional object that exists between mother and child was an inspiration for philosopher Félix Guattari’s concept of the institutional object in his work on transversality and psychiatry.³⁴ Guattari argues that dual relations are always triangular in character, noting that “there is always in a real situation a mediating object that acts as an ambiguous support or medium.”³⁵ Guattari calls this third factor the institutional object.³⁶ His philosophy proposes a new concept: “transversality in the group,”³⁷ an “unconscious source of action,” which carries a group’s desire, “a dimension opposite and complementary to the structures that generate pyramidal hierarchization.”³⁸ For Guattari transversality provides the possibility of bringing the “institutional context, its constraints, organization, practices, etc., all those things and relations which normally exist in the background” into the foreground for critique.³⁹

Gabon’s decision to award Belinga iron project to BHP Billiton reopens past environmental issues

27.03.2013 Daily News (South Africa)

*The Gabonese government has reportedly awarded the mining rights to the Belinga iron ore deposit to BHP Billiton in 2012, causing previous environmental issues associated with the project to resurface. In 2006, China Machinery and Electric Equipment Export & Import acquired the mining licence to the same project, but due to stiff resistance from communities and NGOs it ceased to push through. [Note of the RepRisk Analyst: Company most likely refers to China National Import & Export Corporation.] Opponents strongly objected [to] the proposed dam along the Kongou Falls inside the Ivindo National Park, claiming that it would expose the environmentally-sensitive area to further development and disrupt the habitat of some endangered species. Moreover, the government was also criticized for allegedly repressing activists, such as NGO Brainforest official Marc Ona, who was reportedly harassed and arrested for highlighting the project’s lack of independent environmental impact study. The NGO also sent a letter to China Exim Bank, which induced its withdrawal of funding for the project.*⁴⁰

BHP freezes its mining projects in Gabon

Friday Mar 29, 2013 11:11am EDT

Top global miner BHP Billiton is freezing all its projects in Gabon, mining ministry sources said on Friday, dashing government hopes for sizeable investments in manganese and iron ore production.

A spokesman for BHP was not immediately reached for comment.

The company holds licences in the Central African country for the mining of manganese at Mounana, 650 km east of the capital Libreville, and at Okondja, 150 km further to the north.

Government officials had also said BHP signed a contract a year ago for the Belinga iron ore mine, in northeast Gabon, edging out China’s Comibel. BHP has declined to comment on this.

Configuring critique

“We respect the decision by BHP to freeze its activities in Gabon,” said a senior official at the mining ministry who asked not to be identified. “At the same time this is a blow to the country, which hoped to become the world’s largest exporter of manganese.”

Gabon is the world’s second-largest producer of the mineral, an ingredient in making steel, after South Africa. France’s Eramet has been mining manganese at Moanda in southeast Gabon for some 50 years through its Comilog subsidiary.

Another senior ministry official said the decision had not been well received by the government. “This situation is going to jeopardize the agreement signed between the government and the company for the exploitation of iron ore at Belinga.”

The two sources said BHP’s withdrawal would be officially announced in the coming days. BHP has already closed its office in Libreville.⁴¹

IV

Waking Up: April 2013

Did I really record him in his own office on my mobile phone? Was that wise? I asked him for permission, explaining that it was so I could remember exactly what he had said without having to take notes, and that the information would not go public. And it has not. He agreed. I was very friendly about it. So was he. Maybe it is all fine . . . But trying to find these documents has turned me into a researcher of my own institution. Did it set up a note of mistrust, having the phone there on the desk, between us? What if a colleague who had come to talk to me, on a complex and tricky issue, had asked to record me? Would I be fine about it?

Institutional critique

Benjamin Buchloh coined the term “institutional critique” to describe a strand of conceptual practice developed through the work of artists such as Hans Haacke and Michael Asher in the 1960s and 1970s.⁴² In the Claire Copley Gallery, Los Angeles (1974), for example, Asher removed the partition between the office and exhibition space, revealing to the public viewer the usually hidden operations that allow the gallery to function economically.

More recently Slovenian artist Apolonija Šušteršič has suggested that this kind of work “doesn’t produce any constructive resolution, when it doesn’t effect changes in our political and cultural structures.”⁴³ Her comment was made in conversation with the curator Maria Lind, who has put forward the idea of “constructive institutional critique” to describe the work of Šušteršič and others, which, rather than being “based on negativity,” in her view, “offer[s] a proposal for change, possibly an improvement, or a test of how to do things slightly differently . . . based on dialogue between the artist and the institution, rather than an inherent conflict.”⁴⁴

World Bank Group and other investors in Mozal Smelter accused of providing little benefit to Mozambique

08.04.2013 [The Guardian](#) (United Kingdom)

Tax Campaigners have denounced UK Government financing institutions, the World Bank, and others for allegedly extracting more benefit from the Mozal aluminium smelter than the people of Mozambique. The Jubilee Debt Campaign Tax Justice Network, and Friends of the Earth Mozambique gets only approximately USD 15 million annually while CDC Group, UK Export Finance, Europeans Investment Bank, Industrial Development Corp., International Finance Corp. and private investors BHP Billiton and Mitsubishi receive USD 320 million annually.⁴⁵

BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities Launches Five Year Project for Farmers in Mozambique

17 March 2014, 11:00 AM

BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities today officially launched the LEAD Project in Mozambique, pledging US\$8.8 million over five years to the new agricultural initiative that will benefit smallholder farmers from three districts in Maputo Province.

Managed by ACDI/VOCA, a global economic development organization that has worked in 146 countries since 1963, the LEAD Project stands for “Livelihoods Empowerment and Development” and began in August 2013.

The project will work with more than 50 producer organizations that represent farmers to increase their income and business opportunities, improve production capacity through farm-level training, and facilitate access to financing. The project has already taken the first steps to establish around 30 farmer field schools and over the life of the project it will directly benefit 6,500 households in the area.

BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities Chairman, Ian Wood, said BHP Billiton was proud to be part of a project that is seeking to improve the livelihoods of smallholder horticulture farmers in the Boane, Marracuene, and Namaacha districts of Maputo Province.

“The LEAD project had strong appeal for the BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities’ Directors right from the outset because it builds on people’s affinity with their land in Mozambique and their history in small scale farming,” he said. “We hope the skills and knowledge shared during this project will help improve the livelihoods of people over many generations to come.”

BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities is a charity established by BHP Billiton as part of its community investment program. Most projects supported by BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities are five year projects and they predominantly focus on building capacity of individuals and institutions, so that after the project is completed, it will leave a lasting positive legacy.

BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities supports a number of projects in Colombia, Australia, South Africa, and Mozambique. Other projects in Mozambique, in addition to the LEAD project, focus on maternal and child health, malaria, and access to clean water, with the investment in the country totaling US\$30 million.

BHP Billiton is the major shareholder of the Mozal aluminium smelter in Boane, Mozambique.⁴⁶

V

Waking Up: May 2013

I am so angry I can barely breathe. I am expected to back decisions that have been made without consulting me. It is hard not to wonder if I was excluded from the decision-making process because I am a woman? But perhaps not, as along with the five men who signed the partnership agreement between UCL and BHP Billiton there was one woman. I always knew the vice dean role came with responsibility, but I never really understood the implications and potential contradictions of holding such a title until now.

Situated critique

In visual and spatial culture, feminists have drawn extensively on psychoanalytic theory to think through relationships between the spatial politics of internal psychical figures and external cultural geographies.⁴⁷ With words such as ‘mapping,’ ‘locating,’ ‘situating,’ ‘positioning,’ and ‘boundaries’ appearing frequently, the language of these texts is highly spatialized and discussions of new ways of knowing and being are articulated through spatial concepts such as ‘standpoint theory’ and ‘situated knowledge.’ The development of these two terms, particularly through

the work of Sandra Harding and Donna Haraway, has been key for examining the relationship between the construction of subjects and the politics of location—put simply, where I am influences what I can know and who I can be.⁴⁸

‘Site-writing’ is the name I have given to a practice I have developed to question notions of neutral, objective, and disinterested judgment in criticism, and to draw attention to the situatedness of criticism. Such a project involves rethinking the terms of criticism, specifically judgment, discrimination, and critical distance, from a spatial perspective, one where space is physical and architectural rather than solely metaphorical.⁴⁹ I am interested in how criticism as a practice can investigate the spatial and often changing positions we occupy as critics materially, conceptually, emotionally, and ideologically.

In my book *Site-Writing* I investigate the spatiality of a critic’s relation to a work, adapting Howard Caygill’s notion of strategic critique where a position of judgment is advanced through the process of criticizing,⁵⁰ and in tune with Gavin Butt’s “call for the recognition of an ‘immanent’ rather than a transcendent, mode of contemporary criticality” which is “apprehended within—and instanced as—the performative act of critical engagement itself.”⁵¹

Critics from feminist and performance studies have also expressed an interest in the performative qualities of criticism. Amelia Jones and Andrew Stephenson, for example, take issue with the tradition that the interpreter must be neutral or disinterested in the objects, which s/he judges, and posit instead that the processes of viewing and interpreting involve “entanglement in intersubjective spaces of desire, projection and identification.” “Interpretation,” they argue, “like the production of works of art, is a mode of communication. Meaning is a process of engagement and never dwells in any one place.”⁵²

HSBC criticized for financing Cerrejon Coal Mine and other fossil fuel projects around the world

24.05.2013 *wdm.org.uk* (World Development Movement)

*HSBC has been criticized by the World Development Movement for allegedly bankrolling climate change through its financing of ‘dirty’ fossil fuel projects across the world. For example, HSBC has, together with Barclays, Lloyds, and RBS, supported the Cerrejon Coal Mine by providing GBP 3.1 billion to the companies behind the project, namely Anglo American, Xstrata, and BHP Billiton. Allegedly, the project has destroyed entire villages populated by indigenous and Afro-Colombian communities, failed to bring jobs, damaged rivers and habitats, and caused respiratory problems to people and workers. Moreover, the mine has allegedly exploited cheap labor, and pro-union workers were either intimidated, dismissed, or killed, as in the case of a Sintracarbon leader in 2008. HSBC, together with RBS, has been similarly criticized for financing tar sands exploration by Total and Madagascar Oil, which will reportedly disrupt the water supply and damage the lands of over 120,000 people living within the Bemolanga Oil Field, among other severe impacts. Also, deposits near the Tsingy de Bemaraha nature reserve, a UNESCO World Heritage Site, are reportedly being explored. Similarly, HSBC was criticized for its financial support of Exxon Mobil, which is working on an LNG project in Papua New Guinea, and of Tullow Oil, which is operating in Ghana and Uganda.*⁵³

Multi-million-dollar project for vulnerable communities in Colombia makes strong progress

12 March 2014, 11:00 AM

BHP Billiton is pleased to announce the completion of the first year of a US\$28.6 million project to assist vulnerable and displaced persons in Colombia.

Named *ANDA*, a Spanish word meaning ‘moving forward,’ the project is led by Global Communities, an international non-profit organization that has worked for more than 12 years implementing large-scale development programs throughout Colombia.

A charity established by BHP Billiton as part of its community investment program, BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities made the grant to the five-year *ANDA* project to help vulnerable people, including internally displaced persons, women, youth, Afro-Colombians, and Indigenous persons in Colombia to become more resilient.

The project will help communities advocate for resources with governments, improve the ability of local governments to access municipal, departmental, and national resources, and increase job opportunities and market-driven livelihoods, such as small business enterprises.

BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities Chairman, Ian Wood, said BHP Billiton was proud to be part of a project that will reach more than 40,000 people in six municipalities in the Department of Cordoba and the cities of Monteria and Cartagena. “We are delighted with the high participation of the 18 communities involved in the project to date. Each community has established a representative Community Management Committee with a total of 448 people actively involved,” he said. “The Committees have mapped community assets and are in the process of identifying community potential and prioritizing initiatives for implementation. The positive energy being generated by people who have suffered enormously but who are now feeling empowered to improve their communities and their own lives is inspiring.”

Much of the international and government assistance that has been provided to economically disadvantaged people in Colombia to date has been for emergency support and short-term interventions, rather than for sustainable economic and social development.

The *ANDA* project aims to create sustainable, long-term change by identifying community priorities and encouraging engagement in programming, building capacity of local implementers through mentoring and technical assistance, and coordinating closely with the Government of Colombia at all levels to extend the reach of services and assistance to project participants.⁵⁴

VI

Waking Up: June 2013

As Vice Dean of Research, and having been tasked in January 2013 to ‘own’ the risk of research expansion, I suggest the need for the following three documents:

- 1 **The Environmental, Social, and Governance (ESG) due diligence procedures to be undertaken when deciding whether to accept the funds.**
- 2 **The structures and procedures in place to protect academic independence and integrity.**
- 3 **The performance indicators to monitor how this corporation has been changed by its engagement with UCL.**

Critique as figuration

Rosi Braidotti introduced the figure of the ‘nomadic subject,’ which describes not only a spatial state of movement, but also an epistemological condition; a kind of knowingness (or unknowingness even) that refuses fixity.⁵⁵ And in the feminist figurations of both Braidotti, and before her, Donna Haraway,⁵⁶ spatial arrangements are an intrinsic aspect of their story-telling function; specifically the role of actual locations, and the cartographies of power relations and the differing positionalities they generate. Braidotti writes:

Figurations are not mere metaphors, but rather markers of more concretely situated historical positions. A figuration is the expression of one's specific positioning in space and time. It marks certain territorial or geopolitical coordinates, but it also points out one's sense of genealogy of historical inscription. Figurations deterritorialize and destabilize the certainties of the subject and allow for a proliferation of situated or 'micro' narratives of self and others.⁵⁷

The oral historian Linda Sandino draws on the work of Paul Ricoeur to consider how different forms of figuration operate in narration, relating the act of telling to the told, such that oral history might be itself understood as "a double interpretive operation in which the narrator recapitulates the told in the telling." Following Ricoeur, she describes: the individual in interpreting his or her life "appears both as a reader and writer," and the "story of a life continues to be refigured by all the truthful and fictive stories a subject tells about himself or herself . . . a life is not 'how it was' but how it is interpreted and reinterpreted, told and re-told."⁵⁸

BHP Billiton accused of bribing government officials in China, Cambodia, and Australia

17.06.2013 **The Sydney Morning Herald** (online)

*Australian Federal Police (AFP) has launched an investigation against BHP Billiton over alleged bribery in Cambodia, China, and Western Australia. US authorities have investigated the same since 2009 and referred it to the AFP and the Australian Securities and Investments Commission in 2010. The probe alleges that Australian nationals working for the company bribed government officials in relation to its projects, including a bauxite mine in Cambodia and a hospitality program for the 2008 Beijing Olympics. It is reported that the Australian police initially rejected an inquiry for unknown reason but decided to reopen what has been dubbed one of the country's highest-profile corruption cases.*⁵⁹

Submission to Australia's Senate Economics References Committee Inquiry into Foreign Bribery

28 September 2015, 11:14 AM

BHP Billiton has provided a submission to Australia's Senate Economics References Committee Inquiry into Foreign Bribery.

BHP Billiton is committed to contributing to the global fight against corruption and working with businesses, governments, and civil society in partnership to support this effort. We also believe that eliminating corruption is a commercial imperative.

In its submission, the Company provides information on its anti-corruption compliance efforts, internally and across the industry, and addresses a number of the issues raised under the Committee's Terms of Reference.

*BHP Billiton's submission can be found on the Committee website.*⁶⁰

VII

Stepping down: July 2013

On 1 July 2013 I formally 'step down' from my role as Vice Dean of Research for the Bartlett Faculty of the Built Environment, UCL at a meeting of the Research Advisory Group (RAG) of which I am chair.

But what does this mean?

I think it means that I've withdrawn my consent and refused to collaborate.

I believe it is the 'right' thing to have done, but is it the most effective way to influence the situation?

From Critique as Crisis to the “art of not being governed quite so much.”

My first spoken version of this paper ended with Roland Barthes’s comment that “to *criticize* means to *call into crisis*.”⁶¹ To consider critique as crisis closely mirrored my state of mind in November 2013 at the conference on *Critique*, when I chose to deliver the first version of this paper, under Chatham House rules, so fearful was I of institutional repercussions. I was in crisis at the time, doubting my actions, and feeling panic going through me like electricity each time I spoke.

Following that, I started reading Michel Foucault’s 1978 essay, “What is Critique?,” from *The Politics of Truth*,⁶² and Judith Butler’s close reading of that essay from 2000, entitled “What is Critique? An Essay on Foucault’s Virtue.”⁶³ Butler notes how “[c]ritique is always a critique of some instituted practice, discourse, episteme, institution, and it loses its character the moment in which it is abstracted from its operation and made to stand alone as a purely generalizable practice.”⁶⁴ She talks of how, for Foucault, “‘critique’ is precisely a practice that not only suspends judgment . . . but offers a new practice of values based on that very suspension.”⁶⁵ Butler points to how the practice of critique emerges from “the tear in the fabric of our epistemological web,”⁶⁶ and outlines how, for Foucault, “this exposure of the limit of the epistemological field is linked with the practice of virtue, as if virtue is counter to regulation and order, as if virtue itself is to be found in the risking of established order.”⁶⁷

According to Butler, for Foucault virtue “belongs to an ethics which is not fulfilled merely by following objectively formulated rules or laws.”⁶⁸ This discussion of critique with respect to ethics and to virtue, really started to make sense for me of how I had been practicing critique over the past year. But perhaps the most relevant insight it offered me was around how governance is, as Butler calls it, following Foucault, the ‘signature mark’ of the critical attitude and its particular virtue: “how not to be governed *like that*, by that, in the name of those principles, with such and such an objective in mind, and by means of such procedures, not like that, not for that, not by them.”⁶⁹ I would therefore propose, says Foucault, as a very first definition of critique, this general characterization: “the art of not being governed quite so much.”⁷⁰

Resolution Copper Mining criticized for possible environmental impacts from Resolution Copper Project

26.07.2013 bsnorrell.blogspot.com (Censored News)

The Apache indigenous community has expressed concerns over impacts to the water supply at the Tonto National Forest from the planned Resolution Copper Project. Reportedly, the project is run by Resolution Copper Mine LLC, a subsidiary of Resolution Copper Mine, which in turn is a subsidiary of BHP Billiton and Rio Tinto. The indigenous community has expressed concerns over the mining techniques that would be used for the Resolution Copper Project, which would involve digging tunnels and pumping water. This, the Apache say, would destroy their landscape and deplete water reserves. The Apache have furthermore criticized the companies involved for allegedly spending over USD 1 billion in lobbying US authorities.⁷¹

Interacting with government

BHP Billiton maintains ethical relationships with governments and their agencies, officials and personnel. Our ability to conduct business is directly affected by government decision-making and it is important we have open and constructive relationships with government.

BHP Billiton’s Code of Business Conduct (the Code) is based on Our Charter values. The Code represents our commitment to uphold ethical business practices and meet or exceed applicable legal requirements.

Configuring critique

We believe that exercising consistent and proper business conduct creates loyalty and trust with our stakeholders.

The Code outlines our approach to corporate participation in political activities. It states that “we will not make political contributions in cash or in-kind anywhere in the world.” Consistent with this approach, we do not contribute funds to any political party, politician, elected official, or candidate for public office in any country.

In keeping with local and international anti-corruption laws, we prohibit authorizing, offering, giving, or promising anything of value directly or indirectly (via a third party) to a government official to influence official action, or to anyone to encourage them to perform their work disloyally or otherwise improperly. We also require that third parties acting on our behalf operate to BHP Billiton standards and do not violate anti-corruption laws.

In furtherance of the Code, BHP Billiton has over 50 Group Level Documents (GLDs) that outline the minimum mandatory standards required of all BHP Billiton employees, Businesses, and Group Functions in relation to all key aspects of company operations. Compliance with GLD requirements is subject to rolling internal audit processes.⁷²

Epilogue

Stepping up: July 2013

Following my formal act of ‘stepping down,’ I met various senior managers at UCL to discuss my decision. To my surprise, they all showed support for the work I had been doing on reputational risk and expressed an interest in involving me in developing UCL’s ethical procedures and structures. In an act of what I now see as a ‘stepping up,’ I put forward several proposals for action:

- 1 Prepare a report, based on the BHP Billiton donation, on existing due diligence procedures and performance indicators in place at UCL, for accepting and monitoring funding from corporations for research.
- 2 Help develop UCL’s ethical procedures for accepting and monitoring funding from corporations for research.
- 3 Initiate a research project on the role of ‘influence’ in the corporate funding of university research—based on specific UCL case studies, for example, the BHP Billiton donation.
- 4 Draft a proposal for divestment in fossil fuel—looking at both those corporations/companies in which UCL invests its funds, and those corporations/companies from which UCL accepts gifts, donations, sponsorships, etc.
- 5 Host a public debate on the funding of universities by fossil fuel corporations, to involve a range of speakers with diverse views on the topic.
- 6 Write an academic article on competing narratives in the contested arena of sustainable communities.

From 2013 onwards, I decided to make my own acts of questioning the fossil fuel funding of universities a key strand of my own research and institutional work. In 2014, supported by a Bartlett Small Projects Grant, I set up a research project, *Ethics in Built Environment Research*, identifying specific issues arising in built environment research, with staff and student members from across the Bartlett and UCL. This project included hosting a numbers of seminars and a two-day conference, *Practising Ethics in Built Environment Research*.⁷³ Then in January 2015, I established the Bartlett Ethics Working Group, which, working with UCL’s *Cultures of Integrity*,⁷⁴ to support and guide the practice of ethics in teaching, research, and enterprise in the

Bartlett. And, from 2016, as part of the Bartlett Ethics Commission I have been leading, which is supported by the Bartlett Faculty Office, Bartlett Ethics Fellow David Roberts is developing guidance on ethical practice for students in the form of leaflets, protocols, and case studies for specific kinds of built environment research. In addition, a map of Bartlett expertise in ethics and ethical issues confronted by researchers in the Faculty is being produced—an evaluation of ethical codes in the built environment professions—and we are working towards the production of a Bartlett ‘code of ethics.’

My more critical stance towards UCL’s position on the acceptance of fossil fuel funding and investment in the industry has also continued through organizing seminars and debates with colleagues,⁷⁵ and alongside the amazing student campaigners of Fossil Free.⁷⁶ On 10 February 2016, with the support of colleagues and students from across the university, I took the motion “[t]hat UCL should commit to divesting from the fossil fuel industry and to shifting those funds to ethical investments in renewable energy in 5 years” to UCL’s Academic Board, where, thanks to the support of colleagues, it received 50 motions for, and 18 against.⁷⁷ For *Speech ExtrActions*, organised with Diana Salazar of the Development Planning Unit in October 2016, and funded by the Bartlett “Sea and Currents Fund” and the London Mining Network, speakers from communities in Colombia, Brazil, and Indonesia, as well as associated lawyers, NGOs, and academics, were invited to ‘voice’ as testimonials their experiences of the activities of the extractive industries, specifically BHP Billiton and its subsidiaries.⁷⁸

My own more creative response to BHP Billiton has developed as part of my critical spatial practice connected to J.L Austin’s concept of ‘speech acts,’⁷⁹ and Michel Foucault’s concept of *parrhesia*,⁸⁰ in which my ‘site-writing’ traces actions of speech taken in various sites as interventions into existing institutional structures, performed to critique and activate them. *SILVER*, a ‘fictionella’ as Justy Phillips would have it,⁸¹ was commissioned by artists Justy Phillips and Margaret Woodward as part of *Lost Rocks*, and its narrative was drawn out of my visits to a number of sites connected to BHP Billiton, including its ‘birthplace,’ Broken Hill, a town in the Barrier Ranges of South Australia, where a mineral lode rich in silver was discovered in the late nineteenth century.⁸²

Most recently, in March 2017, *SILVER* was configured, in perhaps its most performative mode of critique yet, in a Courthouse, a historical building that is part of the West Coast Heritage Centre in Zeehan (west Tasmania), a mining town also founded on silver, and connected to one of the early proprietors of the Broken Hill mine.⁸³ Here new voices were added to the multivocal narrative of the fictionella, and redistributed through the six clearly labeled positions of the Courthouse—Witness, Clerk of Court, Police Prosecutor & Lawyer, Defendant, Magistrate, and Audience.⁸⁴ *SILVER: A Courthouse Drama for Six Positions* deals with issues of justice and ethics connected to mining, including reference to specific events related to BHP Billiton—for example, in November 2105 the catastrophic tailings dam burst in Brazil, which occurred as I was making my way to Broken Hill.⁸⁵

Notes

- 1 Jane Rendell, ‘Seven Problematics for Neoliberal Times,’ catalogue essay for a monograph on the artist Apolonija Šušteršič, in collaboration with Museo Arte Contemporaneo de Castilla de León (León and Berlin: Musac and Sternberg Press, 2013) (Spanish/English).
- 2 The world-famous Chatham House Rule may be invoked at meetings to encourage openness and the sharing of information: ‘When a meeting, or part thereof, is held under the Chatham House Rule, participants are free to use the information received, but neither the identity nor the affiliation of the speaker(s), nor that of any other participant, may be revealed.’ See www.chathamhouse.org/about/chatham-house-rule (accessed 26 September 2016).

Configuring critique

- 3 See Jane Rendell, *Site-Writing: The Architecture of Art Criticism* (London: I.B. Tauris, 2010).
- 4 There is no official or formal job description of a vice dean's position or duties at UCL in general or in the Bartlett in particular, but in practice they are a deputy to the dean and their role is to assist and support their specific dean in core areas such as teaching, research, enterprise, and international activities, and/or areas for focus and development, such as most recently in the Bartlett, of policy and public health.
- 5 See for example, Nathan Crick, *Rhetorical Public Speaking* (Abingdon: Routledge, [2011] 2016), p. 2.
- 6 Crick, *Rhetorical Public Speaking*, p. 3.
- 7 See, for example, Donna Haraway, 'Syntactics: The Grammar of Feminism and Technoscience,' in *Modest_Witness@Second_Millennium. FemaleMan_Meets_OncoMouse: Feminism and Technoscience* (London: Routledge, 1997), p. 122 esp. p. 11; and Rosi Braidotti, *Transpositions: On Nomadic Ethics* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2006), pp. 90, 170.
- 8 See RepRisk, *RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton PLC* (also listed as BHP Billiton Ltd) (Tuesday 28 May 2013), which I requested and paid for personally, and RepRisk, *RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton Group* (BHP Billiton) (Tuesday 21 April 2016), which I requested and which was paid for by the Bartlett's Architecture Research Fund.
- 9 See www.reprisk.com/about-reprisk (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 10 See www.teneobluerubicon.com/what-we-do/our-services/narrative-and-message-development (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 11 See note 4.
- 12 See www.bhpbilliton.com/media-and-insights/news-releases/2011/06/bhp-billiton-and-university-college-london-launch-natural-resources-initiative; and www.ucl.ac.uk/enterprise/enterprise-news/cp-archive/bhp-billiton (both accessed 18 April 2017).
- 13 See 'Our Common Future: Report of the World Commission on Environment and Development,' *UN Documents: Gathering a Body of Global Agreements*. See www.un-documents.net/ocf-02.htm#I (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 14 See RepRisk, *RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton PLC* (also listed as BHP Billiton Ltd) (Tuesday 28 May 2013).
- 15 *Ibid.*, p. 2.
- 16 See www.ucl.ac.uk/research/vision-strategy (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 17 *Ibid.*
- 18 www.ucl.ac.uk/transforming-ucl/pdfs/ucl-environmental-sustainability-strategy (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 19 *Ibid.*
- 20 <https://www.ucl.ac.uk/research/images/research-ethics-framework> (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 21 *Ibid.*
- 22 www.ucl.ac.uk/finance/docs/docs-policies-procedures/Guidelines_for_the_Acceptance_of_Donations.pdf (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 23 RepRisk Special Report, ESG Risks in Colombia (December 2014), p. 5. See www.reprisk.com/publications (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 24 David Cunningham, 'Architecture as Critical Knowledge,' in Jane Rendell, Jonathan Hill, Murray Fraser and Mark Dorrian, eds., *Critical Architecture* (London: Routledge, 2007).
- 25 See Peg Rawes, 'Critical Practice,' *Architecture Research Quarterly*, 9(1), 2005, pp. 9–10; and David Leatherbarrow's wonderfully rich discussion of conviction and critique, *Architecture Research Quarterly*, 8(3–4) (2004), pp. 199–202.
- 26 RepRisk, *RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton Group (BHP Billiton)* (Tuesday 21 April 2016), p. 110. See also www.greenpeace.org/international/en/publications/Campaign-reports/Climate-Reports/Point-of-No-Return/ (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 27 'Climate Change'; see www.bhpbilliton.com/society/climate-change (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 28 Andrew McGettigan points out that 'The traditional understanding of a university is of an independent community of scholars pursuing knowledge and advancing learning. Unlike their counterparts in some European countries, UK HEIs are not state institutions, their academics are not civil servants . . . They are legally independent corporate institutions with a charitable status.' He identifies six general categories, including universities like UCL founded prior to 1992, which are chartered corporations, in receipt of a Royal Charter. See Andrew McGettigan, *The Great University Gamble: Money, Markets, and the Future of Higher Education*, (London: Pluto Press, 2013), pp. 126–8.
- 29 See, first, Jane Rendell, 'A Place Between Art, Architecture and Critical Theory,' *Proceedings to Place and Location* (Tallinn, Estonia, 2003), pp. 221–33; and then Jane Rendell, *Art and Architecture: A Place Between* (London: I.B. Tauris, 2006).

- 30 I went on to call this form of criticism—criticism as critical spatial practice—‘architecture-writing,’ and then ‘site-writing’. See, for example, Jane Rendell, ‘Architecture-writing,’ in Jane Rendell (ed.), *Critical Architecture*, special issue of the *Journal of Architecture*, 10(3, June) (2005), pp. 255–64; and Jane Rendell, ‘Site-writing,’ in Sharon Kivland, Jaspar Joseph-Lester and Emma Cocker (eds), *Transmission: Speaking and Listening*, vol. 4 (Sheffield: Sheffield Hallam University Rendell, 2005), pp. 180–94.
- 31 RepRisk, RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton Group (BHP Billiton), (Tuesday 21 April 2016), p. 109.
- 32 See www.bhpbilliton.com/media-and-insights/news-releases/2010/01/approval-for-antamina-expansion (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 33 Jessica Benjamin, *Shadow of the Other: Intersubjectivity and Gender in Psychoanalysis* (London: Routledge, 1998), p. xii.
- 34 Félix Guattari, ‘Transversality’ [1964], in Félix Guattari, *Molecular Revolution: Psychiatry and Politics*, trans. Rosemary Sheed, intro. David Cooper (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1984), pp. 11–23, see the mention of Winnicott on p. 20, n. 7. This was a report presented to the first International Psycho-Drama Congress, held in Paris in September 1964 and published in the *Revue de psychothérapie institutionnelle*, 1.
- 35 Félix Guattari, ‘The Transference’ [1964], in Gary Genosko (ed.), *The Guattari Reader* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1996), pp. 61–8, esp. p. 63.
- 36 Gary Genosko, *Félix Guattari: An Aberrant Introduction* (London: Continuum, 2002), p. 69.
- 37 Guattari, ‘Transversality,’ p. 18.
- 38 *Ibid.*, p. 22.
- 39 Genosko, *Félix Guattari*, p. 70.
- 40 RepRisk, RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton Group (BHP Billiton), (Tuesday 21 April 2016), p. 105.
- 41 A search on BHP Billiton’s website for ‘Gabon’ did not return any hits, so I sourced this article instead: www.reuters.com/article/gabon-bhp-idUSL5N0CL12420130329 (18 April 2017).
- 42 Benjamin H.D. Buchloh identifies the work of certain artists after 1966 as ‘institutional critique’. See Benjamin H.D. Buchloh, ‘Conceptual Art 1962–1969: From the Aesthetic of Administration to the Critique of Institutions,’ *October*, 55 (Winter 1990), pp. 105–43; and Benjamin H.D. Buchloh (ed.), *Michael Asher, Writings 1973–1983 on Works 1969–1979* (Halifax, Canada: Nova Scotia College of Art and Design Press, 1984), pp. 76–81.
- 43 ‘Conversation between Maria Lind and Apolonija Šušteršič,’ *Apolonija Šušteršič, Moderna Museet Projekt*, 4.2–14.3.1999 (Stockholm: Moderna Museet Projekt, 1999) pp. 41–57, esp. p. 56.
- 44 *Ibid.*, p. 56.
- 45 RepRisk, RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton Group (BHP Billiton), (Tuesday 21 April 2016), p. 105.
- 46 ‘BHP Billiton Sustainable Communities Launches Five Year Project for Farmers in Mozambique’; see www.bhpbilliton.com/media-and-insights/news-releases/2014/03/bhp-billiton-sustainable-communities-launches-five-year-project-for-farmers-in-mozambique (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 47 See, for example: Susan Stanford Friedman, *Mappings: Feminism and the Cultural Geographies of Encounter* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998); Diane Fuss, *Identification Papers* (London: Routledge, 1995); Elizabeth Grosz, *Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994); and Kaja Silverman, *The Threshold of the Visible World* (London: Routledge, 1996).
- 48 See Donna Haraway, ‘Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Knowledge,’ *Feminist Studies*, 14(3) (Fall 1988), pp. 575–603, esp. pp. 583–8; and Sandra Harding, *The Science Question in Feminism* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press/Milton Keynes: Open University Press, 1986).
- 49 See, for example, Hal Foster’s discussion of critical distance and identification in *The Return of the Real: The Avant-Garde at the End of the Century* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2001), pp. 223–6.
- 50 Howard Caygill, *Walter Benjamin: The Colour of Experience* (London: Routledge, 1998), pp. 34, 64, 79.
- 51 Gavin Butt, ‘Introduction: The Paradoxes of Criticism,’ in Gavin Butt (ed.), *After Criticism: New Responses to Art and Performance* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2005), p. 7.
- 52 Amelia Jones and Andrew Stephenson, ‘Introduction,’ in Amelia Jones and Andrew Stephenson (eds), *Performing the Body/Performing the Text* (London: Routledge, 1999) pp. 1–10, esp. p. 8.

- 53 RepRisk, *RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton Group (BHP Billiton)* (Tuesday 21 April 2016), p. 105; see www.globaljustice.org.uk/sites/default/files/files/resources/hsbc_briefing_2013.pdf (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 54 www.bhpbilliton.com/media-and-insights/news-releases/2014/03/multi-million-dollar-project-for-vulnerable-communities-in-colombia-makes-strong-progress (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 55 See Rosi Braidotti, *Nomadic Subjects* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994) and Braidotti, *Transpositions: On Nomadic Ethics*. See also, for example, Donna Haraway, 'Syntactics: The Grammar of Feminism and Technoscience,' pp. 1–22; and 'Cyborgs, Coyotes and Dogs: A Kinship of Feminist Figurations and There Are Always More Things Going on Than You Thought! Methodologies as Thinking Technologies: An Interview with Donna Haraway Conducted in Two Parts by Nina Lykke, Randi Markussen, and Finn Olesen' [2000], in Donna Haraway, *The Donna Haraway Reader* (London: Routledge, 2004), pp. 321–42.
- 56 Haraway, 'Syntactics: The Grammar of Feminism and Technoscience,' p. 11.
- 57 Braidotti, *Transpositions: On Nomadic Ethics*, p. 90.
- 58 Linda Sandino, 'Oral History: In and About Art, Craft and Design,' in Michael Partington and Linda Sandino (eds), *Oral History in the Visual Arts* (London: Bloomsbury, 2013), pp. 2–12, esp. p. 9.
- 59 RepRisk, *RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton Group (BHP Billiton)*, (Tuesday 21 April 2016), p. 101; see also www.smh.com.au/national/bribery-probe-targets-bhp-20130312-2fz1p.html (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 60 www.bhpbilliton.com/media-and-insights/news-releases/2015/09/submission-to-australias-senate-economics-references-committee-inquiry-into-foreign-bribery (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 61 Roland Barthes, 'Writers, Intellectuals, Teachers' [1971], in *A Roland Barthes Reader*, ed., with intro., Susan Sontag (London: Vintage, 1982), pp. 378–403, esp. p. 379.
- 62 Michel Foucault, 'What is Critique?' [1997], trans. Lysa Hochroth and Catherine Porter, *The Politics of Truth* (Los Angeles, CA: Semiotext(e), 2007), pp. 41–81.
- 63 Judith Butler, 'What is Critique? An Essay on Foucault's Virtue' (May 2001); see <http://eipcp.net/transversal/0806/butler/en> (accessed 18 April 2017). The endnote states that 'This essay was originally delivered, in shorter form, as the Raymond Williams Lecture at Cambridge University in May of 2000, then published in longer form in David Ingram, ed., *The Political: Readings in Continental Philosophy*, London: Basil Blackwell, 2002.'
- 64 Butler, 'What is Critique?,' n.p.
- 65 Ibid.
- 66 Ibid.
- 67 Ibid.
- 68 Ibid.
- 69 Ibid.
- 70 Foucault, 'What is Critique?,' p. 45.
- 71 RepRisk, *RepRisk Company Report, BHP Billiton Group (BHP Billiton)*, (Tuesday 21 April 2016), p. 99; <http://bsnorrell.blogspot.fr/2013/07/apaches-defend-water-and-oppose.html%20%0A> (accessed 22 July 2015). This website now requires subscription for access, so for an update from 21 February 2017 see, for example, www.wildcat.arizona.edu/article/2017/02/oak-flat-campground-marks-third-year-in-opposition-to-resolution-copper-mine (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 72 'Interacting with Governments'; see www.bhpbilliton.com/our-approach/operating-with-integrity/interacting-with-governments (accessed 25 September 2016).
- 73 For the project Ethics in Built Environment Research, see www.ucl.ac.uk/bartlett/research/spirit-colaboration/ethics-built-environment (accessed 18 April 2017). For reviews, see www.architectsjournal.co.uk/culture/what-are-architects-responsible-for/8685996.article; www.architectsjournal.co.uk/news/riba-and-arb-ethical-codes-attacked/8685535.article; and www.architectsjournal.co.uk/news/porritt-architects-are-failing-to-tackle-climate-change/8685609.article (all accessed 18 April 2017). More details can be found in Jane Rendell, 'Giving an Account of Oneself, Architecturally,' *Journal of Visual Culture*, 15(3) (2016), pp. 334–48, special issue on architecture, edited by Jae Emerling.
- 74 www.ucl.ac.uk/research/integrity (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 75 For the debates concerning fossil fuel divestment, see www.ucl.ac.uk/urbanlab/events/richseamsdark-pools (accessed 18 April 2017) and www.bartlett.ucl.ac.uk/events/divest-fossil-fuels (accessed 18 April 2017). For more details, see Rendell, 'Giving an Account of Oneself, Architecturally'. See also <http://>

- roadtoparis.info/2015/02/11/mining-money-sustainability-research-ucl-bhp-billiton/ and <http://energydesk.greenpeace.org/2015/10/23/data-top-universities-take-134m-from-fossil-fuel-giants-despite-divestment-drive/> (both accessed 18 April 2017).
- 76 <https://campaigns.gofossilfree.org/petitions/ucl-divest-from-fossil-fuels> (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 77 See www.ucl.ac.uk/srs/governance-and-committees/governance/ab/documents/minutes/1516/ab-100216.pdf (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 78 www.ucl.ac.uk/bartlett/development/events/2016/oct/speech-extractions-witness-testimony-evidence-response-mining-industry (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 79 J.L. Austin, *How to Do Things with Words: The William James Lectures Delivered at Harvard University in 1955* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1962).
- 80 Michel Foucault, “Discourse and Truth: The Problematization of Parrhesia.” 6 Lectures given by Michel Foucault at the University of California at Berkeley, October–November 1983, ed. J. Pearson, 1999. See http://foucault.info/system/files/pdf/DiscourseAndTruth_MichelFoucault_1983_0.pdf (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 81 Justy Phillips has defined this as a fiction ‘made with’ rather than ‘made up’: ‘an event always in the making–already made felt’; see www.apublishedevent.net (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 82 See Jane Rendell, *SILVER* (Hobart, SA: A Published Event, 2017), as part of *Lost Rocks*, curated/edited by Justy Phillips and Margaret Woodward; see www.apublishedevent.net/projects/lost-rocks/editions/a-slow-publishing-event (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 83 See www.westcoasterheritagecentrezeehan.com.au/about-the-centre/#centre accessed 18 April 2017).
- 84 See Rendell, *SILVER*, in Justy Phillips and Margaret Woodward, *CROCOITE. CROCOITE. SILVER. SILVER/LEAD* (17–28 March 2017), at the West Coast Heritage Centre, Zeehan, Tasmania, for *Sites of Love and Neglect* (2017), curated by Jane Deeth; see <http://tendays.org.au/event/sites-of-love-and-neglect/> (accessed 18 April 2017). See also www.apublishedevent.net/projects/lost-rocks/editions/crocoite-crocoite-silver-silver-lead (accessed 18 April 2017).
- 85 See, for example, RepRisk, ‘Samarco Mineracao,’ *Most Controversial Companies of 2016* (January 2017), pp. 13–16, www.reprisk.com/publications (accessed 18 April 2017).